Translation Procedures used in Translating Maitreya Buddhist Text ‘紥根与深耕’ from Mandarin into Indonesian

Sutarno
University of Sumatera Utara
Medan, Indonesia

Prof. Tengku Silvana Sinar
Prof. Syahron Lubis
Dr. Zubaidah Ibrahim-Bell
Department of English Letters, Faculty of Culture Studies
University of Sumatera Utara
Medan, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

The aim of this study was to identify the dominant translation procedures applied in the translation of Maitreya Buddhist text entitled ‘紥根与深耕’ from Mandarin to Indonesian. Using descriptive qualitative method and content analysis, the data of the study was analysed to achieve the stated aim. The research primarily attempted to seek answer to research question-what was the most dominant translation procedure applied in the translation of ‘紥根与深耕’ into Indonesian? The data included 141 phrases. The data were analyzed by using Miles and Huberman’s (1986) Data Analysis Model. Vinay and Darbelnet’s theory of translation procedure was used for identifying the procedure applied. The result showed that of the data, 23 included literal translation procedure, 6 borrowing, 20 calque, 31 equivalence, 9 modulation and 52 transposition. It is expected that the finding of this research will be helpful for the Buddhist translators in translating religious text keeping in mind the outcomes of this research.

Keywords: Translation Procedures, Buddhist Text, Maitreya, 文根与深耕, modulation, transposition

1. Introduction

While translating religious text from Mandarin to Indonesian, it can be said that these two languages are in alliance with each other though they have very different culture and expressions. In order to be able to translate a text from Mandarin to Indonesian, a translator need to have a wide area of knowledge on these two languages to overcome the difficulties found in the process of producing a understandable and readable text for target language readers. In this respect, one of the most important religious text in Maitreya Buddhism in Medan, Indonesia was 紅根与深耕 and was translated in to Indonesian as Insaf Nurani. Through interview with one of the priest in Maha Vihara Maitreya temple in Medan, Indonesia, it was found that very few readers wanted to read the translated text. Would it because the translated text above was not acceptable? Based on the above scenario, the research question was formulated as: What was the most dominant translation procedure applied in the translation of ‘紅根与深耕’ from Mandarin into Indonesian? It is expected that the finding of this research will be helpful for the Buddhist translators in translating religious text keeping in mind the outcomes of this research.

Different methods or procedures have been applied in translating while translating a text from source language to the target language. In this regard, Vinay and Darbelnet (in Venuti 2000: 84) mentioned two methods of translation: direct or literal translation and oblige translation method. The former translation method is applied when two languages are equal in terms of structural, lexical and morphological items. Meanwhile, the latter
method applied is when there is reverse of this.

Scholars in translation such as Catford (1965) defined the translation as the replacement of textual material in one language, which is source language, by equivalent material in other language (target language). Bell (1991) also stated that translation is the replacement or a representation of a text in one language by a representation of an equivalent text in a second language. Newmark (1988) also asserts that translation is the attempt of replacing the message in one language by the same message in another language and Sembiring (2015:133) has also stated that translation is the process of transferring the message and form of a written source language text into an equivalent of target language text. They proposed various definitions of translation and most of them know that knowledge of the language is not enough for producing a good and readable translation. Venuti (1995:7-19) stated that translation is a process by which the chain of signifiers that constitutes the source language text is replaced by a chain of signifiers in the target language which the translator provides on the strength of an interpretation. He also states that the aim of translation is to bring back another culture as the same, the recognizable, even the familiar; and this aim always risks a wholesale domestication of the foreign text, often in highly self-conscious projects, where translation serves an appropriation of foreign cultures for domestic agendas, cultural, economic and political.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Translation Procedures

The term of translation procedure and translation techniques have always been considered equal as Newmark (1998, p.88) stated that translation procedures or translation techniques are used for sentences and smaller units of language while the translation method is related to the whole text. In this research paper, the term of ‘translation procedure’ will be used instead of translation techniques. Vinay and Darbelnet (1996) advocated seven translation procedures. They include-‘borrowing’, ‘calque’, ‘literal translation’, transposition’, ‘modulation’, ‘equivalence’, and ‘adaptation’. Each of which can be used at the linguistics level of lexis, grammar and text.

2.1.1. Borrowing

Borrowing is a procedure of translation where the source-language form is taken into the target language usually because of the gap in the lexical of target language. Borrowing a term when it is possible to translate it sometimes might be intended as (Fedorov cited by Fawcett 1997:34) to retain the ‘shade of specificity’ in the foreign object or institution, perhaps adding the translation or some form of explanation to assist the reader. Perhaps other reasons may be to convey a sound effect or to ensure that a cultural element is not translated entirely out of existence. When the Russians launched the first space satellite, the Western press borrowed the term sputnik until they learn to call them satellites.

2.1.2. Calque

Calque is the literal translation at the level of the phrase as Vinay and Darbelnet do not consider its use at the morphemic level in translating terminology. Fedorov stated (cited by Fawcett 1997: 35) calques tend to come into the target language together with the thing they refer to. He further stated that when Russians first had to deal with ‘supermarkets’ they did it so through the calque svierkhraynok, but this proved to be ambiguous and so was replaced by ‘shop without assistants’ before becoming ‘self-service shop’ (Retsker cited by Fawcett 1997: 35). Like borrowing, Calques often make their first appearance not in the translation but as an element in a newspaper article or in some other form of original literature.

2.1.3. Literal translation

Literal translation is word for word translation which Vinay and Darbelnet (as cited in Munday, 2001) describe as being the most common translation procedure used between two languages from the same family and culture. This Procedure is rare but always welcome case when a text can go from source language to target language with no changing other than those required by target language grammar. Vazques-Ayora (as cited in Fawcett, 1997) stated that literal translation is the general strategy. He further stated that: “if given two utterances, one in English and the other in Spanish, there exists between them a precise correspondence of ‘structure’ and of ‘significant’, and the equivalence is achieved moneme by moneme, literal translation result and can be applied without risk”.

2.1.4. Transposition
Transposition is replacing one word class with another without changing the meaning of the message or on other word. It deals with grammatical changes in translation (Vinay & Darbelnet, 2000, as cited in Fawcett, 1997). There are two types of transpositions, obligatory and optional transposition. Obligatory transposition is when the target language has no other choices because of the language system required the translator to do some grammatical changes in order to be readable and grammatical accepted by the target readers. But optional transposition is the translator’s choice and they can use it when it is necessary for the better style of translation (Vinay & Darbelnet, 2000, as cited in Munday 2001). Take for instance- ‘she gave her mother a kiss’ semantically it is the same as ‘she kissed her mother’ but with this differences that in the former sentence ‘kiss’ is a noun but in the latter ‘kiss’ is a verb. The first expression is based on expression and the second on is transported expression.

2.1.5. Modulation

Modulation occurs when the translator reproduces the message of the original text into the target language text in conformity with the current norm and culture of the target language even though the source text and target text may appear different in term of perspective. (Newmark, 1988: 88). It also may be defined as a variation in the message obtained by changing point of view. (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1958 as cited in Fawcett, 1997: 37). As Vazquez-Ayora (as cited in Fawcett, 1997) says, many translators use transposition intuitively but the use of modulation, which requires extensive knowledge of the target language, is far less obvious and more risky. The idea, as explained by Kelly 1979 (as cited in Fawcett, 1997: 37) is that the signifier changes while the signified remains the same, and this is achieved by various form of metaphor, metonymy and synecdoche. Modulation may take place between such things as an abstract and a concrete term, between a part and a whole. Or it may reverse a point of view. Vinay and Darbelnet (1958: 236-8) quote such examples as give a pint of blood/ donnez un peu de votre sang (concrete-to abstract), you’re quite a stranger/ on ne se voit plus (effect-to-cause) from cover to cover / dela premiere a la derniere page (part-to part), you can have it / je vous le laisse (reversal of terms).

2.1.6. Equivalence

Equivalence as the translation of idiom where two languages refer to the same situation in totally different ways. It might cover different stylistic and structural methods in rendering a situation. In such cases, they are dealing with the method with equivalent text so that the culture and history of source language might affect the culture of the target language. Some words and expression have a different meaning in one language but different meaning in the other language. Such as the word ‘can’ in Malay mean ‘boleh’ but in Indonesian mean ‘bisa’. These two words even though have almost the same meaning, but practically they have totally different meaning in application.

2.1.7. Adaptation

Adaptation is the procedure of translation which is used in those cases where the type of situation being referred to by source language is unknown in target language culture and just used in plays, poetries and themes (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1958, 2000: 91). It is also the most open to controversy. It is also a translation procedure where the translator replaces a social or cultural reality in source text with the corresponding reality in the target text. In other words, in adaptation, something specific to the source text is expressed in a totally different way that is familiar or appropriate to the target language culture (Munday, 2001). Such as ‘hot cake’ in English is translated as ‘roasted bean/ kacang goreng’ in Indonesian.

The first three procedures are considered as direct or literal translation and the rest as oblique translation procedures.

2.2 Previous Studies

There are several researches exploring the translation procedures. One of them is Sembiring (2016). He did a research entitled Translating Tutur Si Waloh in Karonese society into English. In his research, he explored the translation problem and its procedures in translating the eight kinship terms in Karonese society into English. His study revealed the absence of Tutur Si Waloh in the target language which was the translation problem in his study. He also applied the paraphrase, cultural equivalent, descriptive equivalent, transference and couplet translation procedures.

Sharei (2017) conducted a comparative study of the strategies employed in ‘the old man and the sea’ translated from English
into Persian on the basis of Vinay and Darbelnet’s Model. His research aimed to examine the use of Vinay and Darbelnet’s translation strategies. His research was comparing the two translators (Daryabandari and Faramarzi) who translated the novel and it found out that the first translator used modulation procedure most while the latter used literal translation procedure most.

Nasution, D., Sinar, T., Lubis, S. & Nurlela. (2017) did a research on translating Malay incantation text of sea offering into English. It was an analysis of translation techniques and translation accuracy. Their research aimed at investigating the techniques of translation employed in the sea incantation text from Malay into English as well as describing the translation quality in the view of its accuracy. It revealed that the most dominant translation technique applied was literal translation and the accuracy of the translation was affected by the translator’s cultural background.

From these three previous researches, it can be summarized that various procedures of translation were employed by the translators even in translating the same text and the dominant translation procedure can be different from one another.

3. Methodology

This research was designed using descriptive-qualitative method and content analysis was employed to analyze the data.

3.1 Data Source and the Data

The data for analysis in this study was taken from the Buddhist text: 紫根与深耕 in Mandarin and its translation ‘Insaf Nurani’ in Indonesian. The texts as data were selected by using the translation procedures proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet (2000) which are direct translation methods (borrowing, calque and literal procedure) and oblique translation methods (transposition, modulation, equivalence and adaptation). Total data included 141 phrases and clauses which included the Maitreya-Buddhist specific terms.

3.2 Data Collection Method

The data was collected through comparison from source text (紫根与深耕) with target text (Insaf Nurani). Every words, phrases and clauses were meticulously observed. Then, the selected words, phrases or clauses were coded and display in tables. Afterwards, the coded data were categorized based on the translation procedure employed. At the end, the data was examined by Buddhism priest and the expert.

3.3 Data Analysis

After collecting the data, the data were analyzed in order to explore the translation procedures employed by using Miles and Huberman (1986) data analysis model. It started with reducing the data, then displaying the data in table, drawing conclusions or verification of data. The data were then categorized based on the seven translation procedures.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1 Results

The direct or literal translation (borrowing, calque and literal translation) and oblique translation method (transposition, modulation, equivalence and adaptation) were chosen and put into table to be investigated to determine the extent to which of these seven procedures were applied by the translator.

Table 1: Literal Translation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Target Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>三千功八百果</td>
<td>3000kebajikan dana 800 pujaana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>借问缘</td>
<td>Kebajikan dana 800 pujaana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>警告了你</td>
<td>Melampui tahu anda mengkhianati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>修天路, 天知路</td>
<td>Menimbiskan dunia, Tuhannya memahami</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>牧羊者为</td>
<td>Mahoni, mahi kudu</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the data above, the data were translated directly from Mandarin to Indonesian with no changing other than the requirement in Indonesian grammar. They were translated by using word for word translation procedure or literal translation like (佛) translated to Buddha. Total phrases found in the data using this procedure were 23 data.

Table 2: Calque Translation Procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Target Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>三千功八百果</td>
<td>3000kebajikan dana 800 pujaana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>借问缘</td>
<td>Kebajikan dana 800 pujaana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>警告了你</td>
<td>Melampui tahu anda mengkhianati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>修天路, 天知路</td>
<td>Menimbiskan dunia, Tuhannya memahami</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>牧羊者为</td>
<td>Mahoni, mahi kudu</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

三千功八百果 consist of two basic phrases, they are 三千功 and 八百果. Both phrases are combined into one to form a new phrase (三千功八百果) and was translated to target language. This direct translation in phrase level was named calque. There were 20 examples in the data using calque translation procedure.

Table 3: Equivalence Procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Target Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>紫根与深耕</td>
<td>BudhaMainaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>修天路, 天知路</td>
<td>Menimbiskan dunia, Tuhannya memahami</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>牧羊者为</td>
<td>Mahoni, mahi kudu</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data in table 3 above were...
translated using the equivalence procedure. The translator used totally different styles and structures in rendering these data. In the data, 弥勒祖师 cannot be rendered part by part in the data; but need a totally different style and structure. There were 31 instances in the data using this translation procedure.

**Table 4: Modulation Procedure**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Target Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>魂經之内</td>
<td>Guru semuakhatibdu sutra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>光備之根</td>
<td>Polokokarangtubabani</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>万物之源</td>
<td>Sumberdarilaksabenda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>无量智慧</td>
<td>Kesarif yang tindabatas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>不生不滅</td>
<td>Hidupkekal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data in table 4 were translated using modulation procedure. It involved changing of the perspective such as in 不生不滅 which can be rendered as ‘not alive and not dead’ but in target language it was replaced by Hidup kekal (immortality) in target language. There were 9 instances in the data using this procedure.

**Table 5: The Transposition Procedure**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Target Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>上帝的分灵</td>
<td>Percikan roh Tuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>良心居所</td>
<td>Mencernelingkungkirimunni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>良心居所</td>
<td>Mutaniirimunni</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>靠山居所</td>
<td>Meninisihlaungnungtahanmenempahiansutode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>良心居所</td>
<td>Kesaktianrimunni</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The translation procedure applied in the table 5 above was the transposition where there was changing of word class from source language to target language. Take for instance 上帝的分灵. It was clause in source language but became a phrase in the target language ‘percikan roh Tuhan’. There were 52 examples in the data done using this translation procedure.

**4.2 Discussion**

As the aim of this research was to identify the most dominant translation procedures applied in the translation of Buddhist Text 素根与深耕 based on the Vinay and Darbelnet model, the result showed that of the 141 data phrases, Transposition Procedure was the most applied one in the translation. It included 52 examples in the data. The transposition translation procedure is defined as the changing of the word class with another without changing the meaning of the message. This indicates that the translators tried very hard to focus on producing the readable translation result so that the reader in the target text, in this case the target reader is Indonesian, can understand the translated text. This finding was in line with the view of Catford (1965), Bell (1991) and Newmark (1988) about the definition of translation. That is replacing the source text message with the second language equivalent material or representation of the message. On the other hand, it goes against the definition of Sembiring (2016) who talk about transferring the form of the source text. It may be because the source text language is totally different from the target text language. Thus, it is impossible to transfer the form of the text. The findings of the study are also different from the findings reported by Nasution, D., Sinar, T., Lubis, S. & Nurlela. (2017) and Sharei (2017) as in their results; the most dominant translation procedure applied was literal translation procedure. In their research the translator tend to be loyal to the source text rather than to the target text readers. However, results of this study are in line with Sembiring’s (2016) results. In his result, it was shown that there was application of cultural equivalent and paraphrase procedure which implies that the translator tried to domesticate the text to the target readers.

The second most applied translation procedure was Equivalence (31 examples) and the third most applied was literal procedure (23 examples); followed by calque (20 examples) and modulation (9 examples) and the least applied was borrowing (6 examples). There was no adaptation procedure found in the translation of the text. The percentagewise information of the procedures used is shown below-

**Figure 1: Percentagewise Application of Translation Procedures**

It can be said that different translation procedures were used with specific objectives in the translation of Buddhist Text ‘素根与深耕’. It is argued that borrowing may seem unproblematic while translating such texts when the target language does not have a word for something; however, the translator may just borrow it from a language which has it. But it is not as simple as that as it raises the question about national identity, power and colonization. However, in some cases, literal translation may be unacceptable as
translation may give another meaning or may have no meaning or may be structurally impossible or may have a corresponding expression, but not within different level of language (Vinay & Darbelnet, 2000, as cited in Munday, 2001).

5. Conclusion

To sum up, the procedures used in translating Buddhist Text 紫根与深耕 were more target language oriented. The translator focused more to produce a readable and understandable translation text.

References


Wang, 紫根与深耕/Insaf Nurani. Taiwan: DPP Mapanbumi.